



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE  
HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION  
REGULAR MEETING**

**MINUTES**

**Monday, September 9, 2019**

**Scottsdale Community Design Studio  
7506 E Indian School Road  
Scottsdale, Arizona 85251**

**PRESENT:** Nadia Mustafa, Chair  
Janice Shimokubo, Vice Chair  
James Eaneman (telephonic)  
Emily Hinchman  
Hannellie Mendoza (arrived at 5:07 p.m.)  
Stuart Rhoden

**ABSENT:** Laurie Coe

**STAFF:** Sharon Cini  
Bill Hylan  
Brent Stockwell

**GUESTS:** Sandra Schenkat  
Luke Douglas  
Paula Waybright  
Carol Consalvo  
Dr. Lisa Sproat

**Call to Order/Roll Call**

Chair Mustafa called the meeting to order at 5:04 p.m.

## **Public Comment**

Sandy Schenkat reiterated her comments from the Commission's March and August meetings, suggesting City Council meetings be opened with a moment of silence instead of an invocation. She noted that the Satanic Temple has filed a lawsuit against the City of Scottsdale for being denied the opportunity to deliver an invocation during a City Council meeting.

Luke Douglas reiterated his comments from the August meeting, on behalf of the Humanists Society of Greater Phoenix. He stressed the importance of separating church and state. He recommended that the Human Relations Commission make a recommendation to City Council that they eliminate the invocation and replace it with a moment of silence.

Paula Waybright stressed the importance of eliminating all invocation from City meetings and events. She felt that invocations and prayers could be perceived by many as a point of division among citizens. A moment of silence would support rights of citizens to worship as they choose.

Carol Consalvo, National Council of Jewish Women advocate, spoke in favor of eliminating invocations during government meetings. She stressed the importance of government bodies being inclusive to all citizens, regardless of their religious beliefs.

### **1. Approval of minutes from the August 12, 2019 meeting**

COMMISSIONER HINCHMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 12, 2019 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES. COMMISSIONER RHODEN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR MUSTAFA, VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

### **2. Presentation, discussion and recommendation for city event signage that would promote the values of a Golden Rule City**

Commissioners reviewed the language presented to be used on Golden Rule Day signage and materials.

COMMISSIONER RHODEN MOVED TO APPROVE THE GOLDEN RULE SIGNAGE AS PRESENTED. VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR MUSTAFA, VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

### **3. Discussion to follow up on August Commission meeting items**

- Invocation

Vice-Chair Shimokubo said that the Commission did follow up with the City Manager's Office regarding the idea of making a recommendation to City Council that they replace the invocation with a moment of silence at the beginning of each meeting. Because of the pending litigation, the City Manager has issued direction that it would be appropriate for the Human Relations

Commission to wait to make any recommendation to City Council regarding invocations until the case has been decided. The case is scheduled to go to trial in December 2019.

Commissioner Eaneman opined that the Human Relations Commission should move forward with the recommendation now. Brent Stockwell, Assistant City Manager, explained that the City Manager's direction is in no way intended to limit the Commission's scope of work; it is meant to be mindful of the Federal Court process.

Commissioner Hinchman commented that delaying further discussion in no way says that the Commission will not in the future make the recommendation to Council. It is best to avoid involvement with ongoing Federal litigation.

Commissioner Eaneman argued that a motion should be made to the effect that the Commission intends to make a recommendation to City Council at a future date that they eliminate the invocation from their meetings.

Bill Hylen reminded the Commission that this agenda item was for information/discussion only.

Mr. Stockwell said that the City is following the legal process. The same substantive issue has been initiated in court by another entity and that process should be allowed to follow through to completion before another entity (the HRC) initiates a recommendation.

Commissioners agreed to have the topic agendaized for a future meeting at a time that is deemed appropriate by the City Manager's office.

- Dr. Sproat letter follow up

Ms. Cini said that when following up on direction from the Commission during the August meeting, she learned more about the complications of having a letter signed by all City Council members. She also learned that Mayor Lane had at that point already taken the initiative to write a letter to Dr. Sproat regarding the incident.

Dr. Sproat said that she was pleased to have received the letter from Mayor Lane and the members of Scottsdale Together Overcoming Prejudice (STOP) are motivated by the City's support.

#### **4. Presentation, discussion and recommendations on 2019 Human Relations Commission strategic plan**

- Review current planning for the Golden Rule celebration 2020

Ms. Cini announced that a planning meeting that will include STOP as a new Community Partner is scheduled for September 10th. Both WestWorld and McCormick-Stillman Railroad Park are being considered as locations for the 2020 celebration.

Commissioner Hinchman spoke in support of holding the event at McCormick-Stillman Railroad Park, because it is most conducive environment for involving children.

Dr. Sproat said that STOP's goal is to put together an event that brings together all of the Diversity Partners to raise awareness with all ages with a focus on educating youth.

- Review planning and schedule for Dinner & Dialogue

Commissioner Rhoden said that there have been no further developments for the next Dinner and Dialogue event since the last meeting. He suggested that the Dinner and Dialogue group be combined as a subcategory under Scottsdale for All. He opined that the change would offer an opportunity for two more Commissioners to work on Scottsdale for All projects and would offer more opportunities to promote Scottsdale for All through the Dinner and Dialogue events.

- Scottsdale for All project – Discuss which Commissioner will volunteer to handle project

Discussion ensued regarding the suggestion to add Dinner and Dialogue to the Scottsdale for All category. Commissioners agreed to agendaize the discussion for a later date, when the incoming Commissioners can take part in the discussion.

**5. Presentation, discussion and recommendation to include STOP (Scottsdale Together Overcoming Prejudice) as a Community Diversity Partner**

VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO MOVED TO APPROVE STOP AS A COMMUNITY DIVERSITY PARTNER. COMMISSIONER HINCHMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR MUSTAFA, VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

**6. Recognition of service and overview of contributions of outgoing Chair Nadia Mustafa**

Chair Mustafa spoke about her time on the Commission and accomplishments that have been made.

Staff and Commissioners individually expressed their appreciation for Chair Mustafa's years of service to the Human Relations Commission and the City of Scottsdale.

**7. Identification of Future Agenda Items**

- Presentation on panhandling signs
- Election of chairperson
- New Commissioner welcome
- ADA transition plan
- Strategic Plan and project assignment review
- Community outreach
- Discussion of possible recommendation to staff and Council that the City write a letter of support for the Equal Rights Amendment (ERA)

The next meeting is scheduled for October 14, 2019.

## **Adjournment**

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. COMMISSIONER RHODEN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR MUSTAFA, VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 5:59 p.m.

Recorded and Transcribed by eScribers, LLC.